

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 GENEVA 00925 01 OF 02 121807Z

50

ACTION EUR-12

INFO OCT-01 IO-10 ISO-00 CU-02 OPR-01 CIAE-00 PM-03 INR-07

L-02 ACDA-05 NSAE-00 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 USIA-06

TRSE-00 SAJ-01 DODE-00 H-01 NSC-05 SS-15 /075 W

----- 129119

R 121732Z FEB 75

FM USMISSION GENEVA

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 647

INFO AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

USMISSION NATO

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 2 GENEVA 925

E.O. 11652: GDS

TAGS: CSCE PFOR XG

SUBJECT: CSCE: DIFFERENCE IN RUSSIAN LANGUAGE VERSIONS OF
REGISTERED TEXTS

REF: GENEVA 7262 NOTAL

1. AS INDICATED REFTTEL, NATO LANGUAGE EXPERTS GROUP BEFORE CHRISTMAS RECESS ESTABLISHED AN AGREED LIST OF DISCREPANCIES BETWEEN ORIGINAL LANGUAGE VERSIONS (USUALLY ENGLISH OR FRENCH) OF REGISTERED TEXTS AND RUSSIAN TRANSLATIONS. EXPERTS GROUP INCLUDED A NATIVE RUSSIAN SPEAKER PROVIDED BY DEPARTMENT'S LANGUAGE SERVICES DIVISION (DIMITRI ARENSBURGER). THEIR LIST OF DISCREPANCIES NOTED A TOTAL OF 337 DIFFERENCES IN TEXTS REGISTERED UP TO THAT TIME. (CSCE SECRETARIAT RUSSIAN TRANSLATORS ARE PREDOMINANTLY SOVIET FOREIGN MINISTRY EMPLOYEES). OF THESE DISCREPANCIES, LANGUAGE EXPERTS QUALIFIED 309 AS RELATIVELY MINOR MATTERS OF STYLE, TASTE OR FORM.

2. THE 28 DISCREPANCIES CONSIDERED TO BE SUBSTANTIVE (FULL LIST BELOW) INCLUDE, FOR EXAMPLE, SEVERAL CASES WHERE IMPORTANT (VASHNI) IS USED IN PLACE OF ESSENTIAL (SUSHCHESTVENNI). IN THE AGREED SENTENCE ON PEACEFUL CHANGES OF FRONTIERS THE ENGLISH PHRASE "CAN BE CHANGED ONLY IN ACCORDANCE WITH ..." IS RENDERED IN RUSSIAN
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 GENEVA 00925 01 OF 02 121807Z

"CANNOT BE CHANGED OTHER THAN IN ACCORDANCE WITH ...". IN BASKET

II, "SUITABLE BUSINESS AND RESIDENTIAL PREMISES FOR PURPOSES OF PERMANENT REPRESENTATION" BECOMES "REQUISITE" OR "NECESSARY" BUSINESS AND RESIDENTIAL PREMISES. AN INDUSTRIAL COOPERATION TEXT ON COOPERATION IN ECONOMIC POLICY AND NATIONAL PLANS CONTAINS THE CONSIDERATION "IN WAYS THAT ARE COMPATIBLE". IN RUSSIAN THE CONSIDERATION IS "TO THE EXTENT AS THIS IS COMPATIBLE". THE RUSSIAN VERSIONS OF THE BASKET III TEXT ON FAMILY VISITS APPEARS TO APPLY ONLY TO PERSONS GOING ABROAD FOR SUCH VISITS, WHEREAS THE ENGLISH VERSION APPLIES ALSO TO PERSONS COMING FROM ABROAD. THE SAME TEXT IN ENGLISH SAYS STATES WILL "FAVORABLY CONSIDER APPLICATIONS FOR TRAVEL WITH THE PURPOSE OF ALLOWING VISITS", WHILE THE RUSSIAN MIGHT IMPLY THAT THE PURPOSE IS ONLY THE "RESOLUTION" OF SUCH APPLICATIONS. LIKEWISE, THIS TEXT REFERS IN ENGLISH TO "TRAVEL DOCUMENTS AND VISAS" BUT IS LIMITED IN RUSSIAN TO "EXIT/ENTRY DOCUMENTS AND VISAS," (WITH EXIT/ENTRY APPLYING TO BOTH DOCUMENTS AND VISAS).

3. WE CONTINUE TO ASSUME DEPARTMENT WILL WISH TO AVOID SUBSTANTIVE DIFFERENCES BETWEEN RUSSIAN VERSIONS OF CSCE TEXTS AND WESTERN LANGUAGE VERSIONS, AND HAVE THEREFORE MENTIONED THIS PROBLEM PRIVATELY TO SOVIETS. THEIR REACTION WAS SHARP: THEY CALLED IT "A TIME BOMB TICKING AWAY BENEATH THE CONFERENCE", AND WE HAVE TAKEN PAINS TO CLARIFY THAT WE DO NOT REPEAT NOT ENVISAGE ALTERING TRANSLATION OF REGISTERED LANGUAGE ON INVIOABILITY OF FRONTIERS, WHERE VERSIONS WITH DIFFERENCE NUANCES OF MEANING WERE DELIBERATELY ACCEPTED TO FACILITATE AGREEMENT (SEE GENEVA 2204 OF APRIL 6, 1974). IN ADDITION, SOME DISCREPANCIES MAY BE OVERTAKEN BY EVENTS AS TEXTS ARE REVISED DURING THE COURSE OF NEGOTIATIONS. NEVERTHELESS, WE BELIEVE SOVIET REACTION INDICATES THIS WILL BE A STICKY PROBLEM, WHICH WILL HAVE TO BE RESOLVED BEFORE THE END OF STAGE II.

4. WE PLAN TO RAISE TRANSLATION PROBLEM AT A FUTURE CAUCUS MEETING OF NATO DELEGATION HEADS, TO SOLICIT ALLIED VIEWS AS TO HOW IT SHOULD BE HANDLED. WE WILL SEEK DEPARTMENT'S INSTRUCTIONS ON HANDLING THIS ISSUE WHEN WE HAVE RECEIVED ALLIED VIEWS AND HAVE FURTHER CLARIFIED POSITION OF SOVIETS.

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 GENEVA 00925 02 OF 02 121810Z

50

ACTION EUR-12

INFO OCT-01 IO-10 ISO-00 CU-02 OPR-01 CIAE-00 PM-03 INR-07

L-02 ACDA-05 NSAE-00 PA-01 PRS-01 SP-02 USIA-06

TRSE-00 SAJ-01 DODE-00 H-01 NSC-05 SS-15 /075 W

----- 129175

R 121732Z FEB 75

FM USMISSION GENEVA

TO SECSTATE WASHDC 648

INFO AMEMBASSY MOSCOW

USMISSION NATO

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 2 GENEVA 0925

5. DISCREPANCIES WHICH LANGUAGE EXPERTS LABELLED AS
SUBSTANTIVE ARE AS FOLLOWS, (RELEVANT TEXTS ARE
AVAILABLE IN EUR/RPM):

TEXT	ORIGINAL	PRESENT TRANSLATION
------	----------	---------------------

1) A 124	"INVOLVING"	"ENTAILING"
----------	-------------	-------------

LINE 21

(2) A126	"CAN BE CHANGED	"CANNOT BE CHANGED OTHER THAN"
	ONLY".	

(3) A136,	"ESSENTIAL"	"IMPORTANT"
-----------	-------------	-------------

LINE 21,

(4) C117,	"MISUNDERSTANDING	"INCORRECT
-----------	-------------------	------------

PARA 4,	AND MISCALCULATION	"UNDERSTANDING AND INCORRECT
---------	--------------------	------------------------------

LINE 5	APPRAISAL".	
--------	-------------	--

(5) C 117	"ESSENTIAL ELEMENTS	"IMPORTANT ELEMENTS"
-----------	---------------------	----------------------

(6) C105, END	"AT THE EARLIEST POS-	RUSSIAN PHRASING CAN BE
---------------	-----------------------	-------------------------

END	SIBLE OPPORTUNITY	MISUNDERSTOOD AS MEANING "AS
-----	-------------------	------------------------------

ING DATE"	TO ITS STARTING DATE AS POSSIBLE	
-----------	----------------------------------	--

"

(7) C110, PARA	"PRIMARILY"	"DIRECTLY"
----------------	-------------	------------

4, END

(8) C110, PARA 5, END	SAME AS 6 ABOVE)	
-----------------------	------------------	--

READ IN THREE COLUMNS FOR REMAINDER SEPARATED BY TWO HYPHENS

(9) C111, 2ND ITEM, END--	SAME AS 4 ABOVE)	
---------------------------	------------------	--

10) D145, LINE 6--	"SUITABLE"--"REQUISITE"	"NECESSARY"
--------------------	-------------------------	-------------

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 GENEVA 00925 02 OF 02 121810Z

(11) E124, LINE 1--	"IN WAYS THAT ARE COMPATIBLE"--	"TO THE EXTENT
AS THIS IS COMPATIBLE"		

(12) F109 END--	"WASTE"--"INDUSTRIAL WASTE"	(I.E. WASTE PRODUCTS)
-----------------	-----------------------------	-----------------------

(13) F 114, SUBPARA 3, LINES 2-4--	FOR APPLIED SCIENTIFIC AND TECH-	
NOLOGICAL RESEARCH AND FOR TRANSFERRING ITS ACHIEVEMENTS"--	"FOR	
CARRYING OUT APPLIED SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH AND TECHNOLOGICAL DEVELOP-		
MENT AND APPLYING THEIR RESULTS"		

(14) G128, PARA 3, END--	"WHICH NECESSITATES CONTINUED AND THOROUGH	
EDUCATIVE ACTION"--	"THAT THEY (I.E.	

THE POPULATION GROUPS AND SOCIAL FORCES)	CARRY OUT	
--	-----------	--

CONTINUED AND THOROUGH EDUCATIVE WORK"		
--	--	--

- (15) G-128, PARA 4, LINE 2/3--"MUST BE COMPATIBLE WITH"--"MUST BE MATCHED BY"
- (16) G128, PARA 3, LINE 3--"BY THE COMPARISON"--"BY AGREEING ON"
- (17) G128, PAGE 2, PARA 6, BEG.--"TO ATTAIN"--"IN FULFILLING"
- (18) G128 PAGE 4, PARA 3, LINES 2-3--"PROCEDURES FOR ESTABLISHING ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENTS"--"PROCEDURES FOR SETTING FINES FOR ACTIONS HARMFUL TO THE ENVIRONMENT"
- (19) H107, PARA 1--"DES CARES AT DES TECHNICIENS"--"THE RUSSIAN VERSION USES "CADRES"-FOR BOTH TERMS. THE RUSSIAN MEANING IS AS BROAD AS INCLUDING ALL PERSONNEL, FROM BLUE-COLLAR WORKERS TO MANAGEMENT.
- (20) H109, LINE 3-4--"HUMAN..PROBLEMS"--"HUMANISTIC PROBLEMS"
- (21), H122, END--"IN THE FRAMEWORK", "DANS LE CADRE"--"AT THE PLACE OF"
- (22) I 103, LINE 3--"PRIVATELY AND OFFICIALLY"--"(AN) UNOFFICIAL AND OFFICIAL (BASIS)"
- (23) I 103, LINE 5--"PRIVATELY AND OFFICIALLY"--"(AN) UNOFFICIAL AND OFFICIAL (BASIS)"
- (23) I 103, LINE 5--"DECLARE THEMSELVES DETERMINED"--"DECLARE THEMSELVES WILLING"
- (24) I 103, LINE 6--"TO TAKE APPROPRIATE MEASURES"--"TO TAKE MEASURES THEY CONSIDER SUITABLE"
- (25) I 103, LINE 6-7--"TO CONCLUDEARRANGEMENTS AMONGTHEM"--"TO CONCLUDE AGREEMENTS AMONG THEM"
- (26) I 118, PARA 1--THE ENGLISH ORIGINAL DEALS WITH TRAVEL TO AND VISTS TO P. STATES BY PERSONS FROM ABORAD "WITH THE PURPOSE OF ALLOWING PERSONS TO ENTER AND LEAVE THEIR TERRITORY""--THE RUSSIAN VERSIONS DEALS WITH TEMPORARILY GOING ABROAD FROM THE TERRITORY OF ANY P.S.
- (27) I 118 PARA 1, 1ST PARENTHESIS--"FAVOURABLY CONSIDER APPLICA-CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 GENEVA 00925 02 OF 02 121810Z

- TIONS FOR TRAVEL WITH THE PURPOSE OF ALLOWING"--"FAVOURABLY CONSIDER WITH THE PURPOSE OF THEIR RESOLUTION/PER MISSION, APPLICATIONS REQUESTS FOR TEMPORARY TRAVEL"-THE TERM USED FOR GRANTING REQUESTS DOES NOT CORRESPONDE TO NORMAL RUSSIAN USAGE, DOES NOT CLEARLY IMPLY POSITIVE DECISION ON APPLICATIONS.
- (28) I 118 PARA 2, LINE 4--"TRAVEL DOCUMENTS AND VISAS"--"EXIT/ENTRY DOCUMENTS AND VISAS"("EXIT/ENTRY" APPLYING TO BOTH "DOCUMENTS AND VISAS") DALE

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01 JAN 1994
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: DOCUMENTS, LANGUAGE, TRANSLATIONS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Draft Date: 12 FEB 1975
Decaption Date: 01 JAN 1960
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Authority: GolinoFR
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 28 MAY 2004
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1975GENEVA00925
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Film Number: D750051-0332
From: GENEVA
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1975/newtext/t19750251/aaaabtlt.tel
Line Count: 214
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Office: ACTION EUR
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 4
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 75 GENEVA 7262
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Authority: GolinoFR
Review Comment: n/a
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 16 JUN 2003
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review History: RELEASED <16 JUN 2003 by BoyleJA>; APPROVED <17 JUN 2003 by GolinoFR>
Review Markings:

Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
05 JUL 2006

Review Media Identifier:
Review Referrals: n/a
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: CSCE: DIFFERENCE IN RUSSIAN LANGUAGE VERSIONS OF REGISTERED TEXTS
TAGS: PFOR, XG, UR, CSCE
To: STATE
Type: TE
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 05 JUL 2006